BEFORE THE

OHIO ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY

In the Matter of:

Sales Promotion Printing, Inc. 6555 Carnegie Avenue Cleveland, Ohio 44103 Director's Final Findings and Orders ENTERED DIRECTOR'S JOURNAI

OHIO E.P.A.

PREAMBLE

It is agreed by the parties hereto as follows:

I. JURISDICTION

These Director's Final Findings and Orders ("Orders") are issued to Sales Promotion Printing, Inc. ("Respondent") pursuant to the authority vested in the Director of the Ohio Environmental Protection Agency ("Ohio EPA") under Ohio Revised Code ("ORC") §§ 3704.03 and 3745.01.

II. PARTIES BOUND

These Orders shall apply to and be binding upon Respondent and successors in interest liable under Ohio law. No change in ownership of Respondent's facility (as hereinafter identified) shall in any way alter Respondent's obligations under these Orders.

III. DEFINITIONS

Unless otherwise stated, all terms used in these Orders shall have the same meaning as defined in ORC Chapter 3704 and the regulations promulgated thereunder.

IV. <u>FINDINGS</u>

The Director of Ohio EPA has determined the following findings:

1. Respondent operates a commercial screen printing facility located at 6555 Carnegie Avenue, Cleveland, Cuyahoga County, Ohio, that is a Title V source, as defined in Ohio Administrative Code ("OAC") Rule 3745-77-01(LL), and is subject to the requirements of ORC Chapter 3704 and OAC Chapter 3745-77.

2. OAC Rule 3745-77-02(A) states, in part, that the owner or operator of a Title V source shall not operate such source after the date that a timely and complete Title V permit application is required.

Director's Final Findings and Orders Sales Promotion Printing, Inc. (Case #2384) Page 2 of 7

3. OAC Rule 3745-77-04(E) requires that a Title V permit renewal application be filed no earlier than eighteen months and no later than six months prior to the expiration of any Title V permit.

4. OAC Rule 3745-77-06(A) states, in part, that if the owner or operator of Title V source submits a timely and complete application for permit renewal, the failure to have a Title V permit is not a violation of this Chapter until the Director takes final action on the application.

5. ORC § 3704.05(C) states, in part, that no person who is a holder of a permit issued under ORC § 3704.03(F) or (G) shall violate any of its terms or conditions.

6. ORC § 3704.05(G) states, in part, that no person shall violate any order, rule, or determination of the Director issued, adopted, or made under ORC Chapter 3704.

7. ORC § 3704.05(J)(2) states, in part, that no person shall violate any filing requirement of the Title V permit program.

8. ORC § 3704.05(K) states, in part, that no person shall operate a source that is required to obtain a Title V permit unless a Title V permit has been issued authorizing operation of the source or unless a complete and timely application for the issuance, renewal, or modification of a Title V permit for the source has been submitted to the Director.

9. ORC § 3704.06(C) provides, in part, that any person violating ORC § 3704.05 shall pay a civil penalty of not more than \$25,000 for each day of each violation.

10. On August 7, 1998, Ohio EPA issued a final Title V permit for Respondent's facility (Ohio EPA facility identification number 13-18-00-1513). The permit's expiration date of August 6, 2003, was given in the Final Issuance cover page of the permit, as well as a statement that Title V permit renewal applications are to be filed no earlier than eighteen months and no later than six months prior to the expiration of any Title V permit.

11. In a letter dated September 6, 2002, Ohio EPA sent a notice of Title V permit expiration to Respondent. This letter stated that Respondent's Title V permit was to expire on August 6, 2003, and provided a description of the renewal application requirements and procedures.

12. Respondent failed to submit an application to renew its Title V permit to Ohio EPA six months prior to the permit expiration date (i.e., by February 7, 2003), in violation of OAC Rule 3745-77-04(E) and ORC § 3704.05(G) and (J)(2).

13. Respondent submitted a complete Title V permit renewal application to Ohio EPA on June 13, 2003, one hundred and twenty-six (126) days after the filing due date.

14. Respondent's Title V permit expired on August 6, 2003. Respondent continued to operate a Title V source without a Title V permit or a timely filed and complete

Director's Final Findings and Orders Sales Promotion Printing, Inc. (Case #2384) Page 3 of 7

renewal application, in violation of OAC Rule 3745-77-02(A) and ORC § 3704.05(G) and (K).

15. On October 28, 2003, the Cleveland Division of Air Quality ("CDAQ"), Ohio EPA's contractual representative in Cuyahoga County, inspected Respondent's facility. In the course of the inspection, CDAQ determined that Respondent had not submitted a written semi-annual deviation report to CDAQ, as required by Respondent's Title V permit (Part I, General Terms and Conditions, A.1.c.iii.). CDAQ sent a letter of warning to Respondent regarding this deficiency on November 7, 2003. CDAQ required that Respondent submit a semi-annual deviation report for the period January 1, 2003 through June 30, 2003, within fourteen (14) days of receipt of the letter of warning. On November 18, 2003, Respondent submitted this report to CDAQ. On November 24, 2003, CDAQ, in a follow-up letter to Respondent, acknowledged receipt of the report and stated that, at that time, it would pursue no further enforcement action.

16. On May 11, 2004, CDAQ issued a notice of violation ("NOV") to Respondent, citing it with violation of OAC Rules 3745-77-04(E), for failing to submit a timely and complete application for renewal of its Title V permit, and 3745-77-02(A), for operating a Title V facility without a Title V permit or a timely filed and complete application.

17. The Director has given consideration to, and based his determination on, evidence relating to the technical feasibility and economic reasonableness of complying with the following Orders and their relation to benefits to the people of the State to be derived from such compliance.

V. ORDERS

The Director hereby issues the following Orders:

1. Respondent shall pay the amount of sixteen thousand dollars (\$16,000) in settlement of Ohio EPA's claims for civil penalties, which may be assessed pursuant to ORC Chapter 3704. Twelve thousand, one hundred, and eighty-eight dollars (\$12,188) of the total civil penalty amount shall be paid to Ohio EPA by official checks made payable to "Treasurer, State of Ohio" pursuant to the following schedule:

Two thousand and thirty-one dollars (\$2,031) due within thirty (30) days after the effective date of these Orders;

Two thousand and thirty-one dollars (\$2,031) due within one hundred and twenty (120) days after the effective date of these Orders;

Two thousand and thirty-one dollars (\$2,031) due within two hundred and ten (210) days after the effective date of these Orders;

Two thousand and thirty-one dollars (\$2,031) due within three hundred (300) days after the effective date of these Orders;

Director's Final Findings and Orders Sales Promotion Printing, Inc. (Case #2384) Page 4 of 7

Two thousand and thirty-one dollars (\$2,031) due within three hundred and ninety (390) days after the effective date of these Orders; and

Two thousand and thirty-three dollars (\$2,033) due within four hundred and eighty (480) days after the effective date of these Orders.

Each official check shall be submitted to Brenda Case, or her successor, together with a letter identifying the Respondent, to the following address:

Ohio EPA, Office of Fiscal Administration P.O. Box 1049 Columbus, Ohio 43216-1049

A copy of each of the above checks shall be sent to James A. Orlemann, Assistant Chief, SIP Development and Enforcement, or his successor, at the following address:

> Ohio EPA Division of Air Pollution Control P.O. Box 1049 Columbus, Ohio 43216-1049

2. In lieu of payment to Ohio EPA of the remaining three thousand, eight hundred and twelve dollars (\$3,812) of the civil penalty, Respondent shall fund the supplemental environmental project ("SEP") identified in Order 3. In the event Respondent defaults or otherwise fails to complete any of the project as specified in Order 3, the \$3,812 for the project in Order 3 shall immediately become due and payable to Ohio EPA. Such payment shall be made by an official check made payable to "Treasurer, State of Ohio" and sent to Brenda Case, or her successor, together with a letter identifying the Respondent, to the above-stated address. A copy of the check shall be sent to James A. Orlemann, or his successor, at the above-stated address.

3. Respondent shall perform the SEP project consisting of solvent use reduction at its facility through the use of biodegradable ink degradent, with a volatile organic compound ("VOC") content of no greater than 1.2 pounds per gallon, in place of #20 laquer thinner for the cleaning of squeegees. This project shall be completed as expeditiously as practicable, but not later than one hundred and eighty (180) days after the effective date of these Orders. It is estimated that this SEP will reduce VOC emissions by 2,178 pounds per year, and will cost approximately \$4,872 per year after the first year of implementation.

4. Respondent shall submit a progress report for the project specified in Order 3 no later than fourteen (14) days after the specified completion date. The report shall include a narrative description of whether the project has been completed and how this has been accomplished, with any documentation necessary to demonstrate that the project is completed. If the project has not been completed, the report shall include an explanation of the reasons for the missed completion date, a description of all actions to be taken to complete the project, and a proposed schedule to complete the project. In the event of a

Director's Final Findings and Orders Sales Promotion Printing, Inc. (Case #2384) Page 5 of 7

 \mathbb{S}

missed completion date, a follow-up progress report shall be submitted every fourteen (14) days after the initial report of non-completion until the project is completed.

5. Respondent shall continue to comply with all terms and conditions of its Title V permit, as issued on August 7, 1998, until the Director takes final action on the application submitted on June 13, 2003.

VI. <u>TERMINATION</u>

Respondent's obligations under these Orders shall terminate when Respondent certifies in writing and demonstrates to the satisfaction of Ohio EPA that Respondent has performed all obligations under these Orders and the Chief of Ohio EPA's Division of Air Pollution Control acknowledges, in writing, the termination of these Orders. If Ohio EPA does not agree that all obligations have been performed, then Ohio EPA will notify Respondent of the obligations that have not been performed, in which case Respondent shall have an opportunity to address any such deficiencies and seek termination as described above.

The certification shall contain the following attestation: "I certify that the information contained in or accompanying this certification is true, accurate and complete."

This certification shall be submitted by Respondent to Ohio EPA and shall be signed by a responsible official of Respondent. For purposes of these Orders, a responsible official is as defined in OAC Rule 3745-35-02(B)(1) for a corporation.

VII. OTHER CLAIMS

Nothing in these Orders shall constitute or be construed as a release from any claim, cause of action or demand in law or equity against any person, firm, partnership or corporation, not a party to these Orders, for any liability arising from, or related to the operation of Respondent's facility.

VIII. OTHER APPLICABLE LAWS

All actions required to be taken pursuant to these Orders shall be undertaken in accordance with the requirements of all applicable local, state, and federal laws and regulations. These Orders do not waive or compromise the applicability and enforcement of any other statutes or regulations applicable to the Respondent.

IX. MODIFICATIONS

These Orders may be modified by mutual agreement of the parties hereto. Modifications shall be in writing and shall be effective on the date entered in the journal of the Director of Ohio EPA. Director's Final Findings and Orders Sales Promotion Printing, Inc. (Case #2384) Page 6 of 7

X. <u>NOTICE</u>

All documents required by these Orders, unless otherwise specified in writing, shall be addressed to:

Cleveland Division of Air Quality 1925 St. Clair Avenue Cleveland, Ohio 44114-2080 Attention: Andrew Shroads, Enforcement Manager

and to:

Ohio Environmental Protection Agency Lazarus Government Center Division of Air Pollution Control P.O. Box 1049 Columbus, Ohio 43216-1049 Attention: Thomas Kalman, Manager, Enforcement Section

or to such persons and addresses as may here after be otherwise specified in writing by Ohio EPA.

XI. <u>RESERVATION OF RIGHTS</u>

Ohio EPA and Respondent each reserve all rights, privileges, and causes of action, except as specifically waived in Section XII of these Orders.

XII. <u>WAIVER</u>

In order to resolve disputed claims, without admission of fact, violation, or liability, and in lieu of further enforcement action by Ohio EPA for only the violations specifically cited in these Orders, Respondent consents to the issuance of these Orders and agrees to comply with these Orders. Compliance with these Orders shall be a full accord and satisfaction for the Respondent's liability for the violations specifically cited herein.

Respondent hereby waives the right to appeal the issuance, terms and conditions, and service of these Orders, and Respondent hereby waives any and all rights Respondent may have to seek administrative or judicial review of these Orders either in law or equity.

Notwithstanding the preceding, Ohio EPA and the Respondent agree that if these Orders are appealed by any other party to the Environmental Review Appeals Commission, or any court, Respondent retains the right to intervene and participate in such appeal. In such an event, Respondent shall continue to comply with these Orders notwithstanding such appeal and intervention unless said Orders are stayed, vacated, or modified. **Director's Final Findings and Orders** Sales Promotion Printing, Inc. (Case #2384) Page 7 of 7

XIII. EFFECTIVE DATE

The effective date of these Orders is the date these Orders are entered into the Ohio EPA Director's journal.

XIV. SIGNATORY AUTHORITY

Each undersigned representative of a party to these Orders certifies that he or she is fully authorized to enter into these Orders and to legally bind such party to these Orders.

IT IS SO ORDERED AND AGREED:

Ohio Environmental Protection Agency

Joseph P K 'ne Director

R I

Date

IT IS SO AGREED:

Sales Promotion Printing, Inc.

Signature

Date

William B. ComisKe Printed or Typed Name

ESIDENT

Title